FORCED ORGAN HARVESTING IN CHINA

“On the street, if someone assaults you or steals your purse, you can scream for help. Tied to a hospital bed in the surgical room of a labour camp, no one can hear your screams. In China, it is the state itself that is involved in organ stealing.” – Anastasia Lin

“Mass killing of innocents” – David Matas

“A form of genocide cloaked in modern medical scrubs” – Ethan Gutmann

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Strong evidence has been presented to the Conservative Party Human Rights Commission that the practice of forced organ harvesting continues to be carried out in China. This report is intended to summarise the complex evidence the Commission has received, highlight the sources of evidence for further investigation, and urge Her Majesty’s Government to consider urgently calls for a United Nations-led commission of inquiry into this practice, or to work with other governments to establish an independent, international inquiry through other mechanisms, and to consider all other options for action to stop this barbaric practice. It should be noted that this report is based only on evidence received by the Commission, which the Commission has not been in a position to verify itself.

Four key points came through in the evidence received by the Conservative Party Human Rights Commission inquiry:

1. The scale of organ harvesting in China is far higher than previously estimated;
2. In China, organ transplants are available at extraordinarily short notice, in contrast to the West where patients requiring a transplant must wait months or even years for a donor. In China, patients can even choose their appointment for a transplant operation, at a few days’ notice. How and why are organs so readily and quickly available on demand, and where are they sourced from?;
3. Many of those targeted for organ harvesting are prisoners of conscience, including practitioners of Falun Gong as well as Tibetan Buddhists, Uyghur Muslims and unregistered house church Christians;
4. The practice is carried out live – the victim typically dies in the process, when a vital organ such as a heart is removed or, in cases involving other organs, if they survive, they are subsequently executed. Therefore the testimonial evidence is drawn only from witnesses, since by definition there are no ‘survivors’.
BACKGROUND

In June 2016, the Conservative Party Human Rights Commission published our report on China, *The Darkest Moment: The Crackdown on Human Rights in China 2013-2016*, which drew on evidence received during an inquiry involving two three-hour hearings in Parliament, and over 30 written submissions. In the hearings, among the many human rights issues presented, we heard evidence from at least two witnesses of the practice of forced organ harvesting in China, and we included a brief section on this issue in the report. In our recommendations, we called for an international, independent review of organ harvesting in China to be established, for legislation to prohibit organ tourism to China, for the release of statistics on the number of British citizens who travel to China for organ transplants each year, and for a list of doctors engaged in organ harvesting in China to be compiled and a travel ban introduced for those associated with such practices. We also concluded that so disturbing was the evidence we heard, that we would look into the issue further as a separate study.

The Conservative Party Human Rights Commission began that specific study of forced organ harvesting in China almost immediately after the release of *The Darkest Moment*, by holding a hearing in Parliament focused on the issue. We received evidence from Ethan Gutmann, a researcher and journalist, and David Matas, a human rights lawyer, co-authors of a major new report, *Bloody Harvest/The Slaughter: An Update*, as well as Anastasia Lin, a Chinese-born Canadian actress and Miss World Canada who is also an activist on China human rights and whose new film, *The Bleeding Edge*, depicts the practice of forced organ harvesting. We also heard evidence from Dr Enver Tohti, a Uyghur doctor from China who has admitted to conducting one operation to remove organs from a prisoner. Mr Gutmann and Ms Lin also gave evidence in our earlier hearings for the wider inquiry on human rights in China.

On 6 September, the Speaker of the House of Commons hosted a screening in Speaker’s House of *The Bleeding Edge*, followed by a panel discussion with Ms Lin, Mr Gutmann, the film’s director Leon Lee and the executive producer Jason Loftus.

An Early Day Motion will be tabled by Fiona Bruce MP, which notes with grave concern new reports of the continuing practice of forced organ harvesting in the People’s Republic of China; further notes that the principal victims targeted for forced organ extraction are

---

1 The Darkest Moment: The Crackdown on Human Rights in China 2013-2016


4 The Bleeding Edge - http://thebleedingedgemovie.com/


7 BBC Radio 4 World Tonight: interview with Anastasia Lin and Benedict Rogers, Deputy Chairman of the Conservative Party Human Rights Commission – available from 17 minutes 50 seconds in to the programme onwards: http://www.bbc.co.uk/programmes/b07rk5mb
reportedly prisoners of conscience including practitioners of Falun Gong, Tibetan Buddhists, Uighur Muslims and unregistered house church Christians; acknowledges the evidence detailed in a major new report, Blood Harvest/The Slaughter: An Update, by former Canadian Member of Parliament David Kilgour, human rights lawyer David Matas, and researcher Ethan Gutmann, and the evidence presented in the new narrative thriller film The Bleeding Edge, which is based on true stories and was recently screened in Parliament; notes the United States House of Representatives resolution 343 on forced organ harvesting in China, and the European Parliament written declaration 2016/WD48, both passed in June 2016; and calls on the Government of the People’s Republic of China to immediately end the practice of forced organ harvesting; urges Her Majesty’s Government to condemn the practice of forced organ harvesting in China; to work with other countries to seek a United Nations commission of inquiry to investigate the practice of forced organ harvesting in China or to conduct an inquiry through other international mechanisms, and to assess whether this practice could amount to a crime against humanity under international law; further urges Her Majesty’s Government to release statistics on the numbers of United Kingdom citizens travelling to China for organ transplants; calls on Her Majesty’s Government to introduce legislation to prohibit British citizens from travelling to China for the purpose of receiving organ transplants until the practice of forced organ harvesting ends; urges Her Majesty’s Government to introduce a travel ban prohibiting medical personnel and government officials engaged in the practice of forced organ harvesting from travelling to the United Kingdom; and calls on Her Majesty’s Government to give urgent consideration to other measures it could take to hold the government of the People’s Republic of China to account for this practice and demand an end to forced organ harvesting.

On 11 October a debate will be held in Westminster Hall. This report is intended to provide a summary of the evidence the Conservative Party Human Rights Commission has heard, together with policy recommendations for what steps could be taken to help end this appalling practice. It is also intended to highlight more extensive sources of evidence, which can be studied for further information and which are cited in this report.

SUMMARY OF EVIDENCE
“Everyone in the prison knows about this. Usually in the prison, regardless of whether the person is deceased, if he is sent to the prison hospital, he faces the reality of having his organs removed at any moment. ... Everyone in prison knows that there exists a list of names. People are taken away, and no one will return. Every year it’s like this. They always take away a group of people. Not too many. Sometimes several dozen, sometimes under twenty, from every place they call a “prison ward”. The harshest time was in the middle of 2006. I remember it was at midnight ... Suddenly we heard the noise of a vehicle starting outside. We were very curious, because the whole prison was very quiet. So I stuck my head out of the window to look, as did some other prisoners. We saw parked outside were three or four large buses, with iron bars blocking the windows. There were also a few armed police’s military vehicles, as well as the prison guards’ cars and some ambulances like the ones from the hospital, but they were not official. Then in several columns the armed police and the prison guards entered into the prison ward I was in. Then, starting from the first floor, noises kept arising. When it finally reached our floor, the third floor, I heard that the guards and the police were scolding the prisoners, “Don’t look. Turn your face. Lie on the bed.” “When your name is called, come out immediately. You are not allowed to bring anything.” Then only names were called, one after another. Sometimes only one name would be called for a prison cell. When they reached my cell, they called away three prisoners. I saw that everyone’s eyes were filled with fear ..... One night, a lot of prisoners were forcibly taken away and they were put into the same jail as me. A few buses parked here. The armed police were guarded outside with their cars parked here too. And then the prison guards and the armed police entered the empty courtyard of the building I lived in, afterwards they entered into the building and made the prisoners come out group by group. Then they led them onto the buses outside of the walls. Then they quickly took them away. I once asked a prison doctor, because this particular doctor was very sympathetic to us Falun Gong practitioner. He was especially sympathetic towards me, because we were from the same hometown. Once he told me secretly, saying, “Don’t go against the Communist Party. Don’t resist them. Whatever they tell you to do, just do it. Don’t go against them forcefully. If you do, then when the time comes, you won’t even know how you will have died. When it happens, where your heart, liver, spleen, and lungs will be taken, you won’t even know either.” At that time the doctor also told me, “Falun Gong practitioners, they all practice qigong. They often exercise their bodies, so their bodies are very good. So think about it, those organs are of course very good also. So do you think we rather pick you practitioners or those other prisoners? Those prisoners all abuse drugs or alcohol. Otherwise they still have many unhealthy habits. It might happen that, when you take their organs, they are damaged beyond repair. You practitioners’ organs are the best.” – Yu Xinhui, former prisoner.

Yu Xinhui was a prisoner who had three physical examinations while in prison, the last of which, in March 2005, was under the surveillance of armed prison guards. His story is not unusual. Many former prisoners of conscience have testified to having been subjected to physical examinations in prison which went beyond normal medical check-ups and were clearly aimed at assessing the health of their organs. As Anastasia Lin told our hearing in June 2016, “I first learned about these allegations nearly a decade ago. But it took me a long time

---

8 Yu Xinhui interview, translated by Matthew Robertson: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=jfkxshiw08I
to really confront the gravity of these crimes, to consider deeply what it means that tens of thousands – or hundreds of thousands – of innocent people have been killed for their organs.

Although there are a variety of sources of evidence, there are three key reports which provide detailed research into the practice of forced organ harvesting in China. The first, published on the Internet in 2006 and in print in 2009, was a report researched and written by the former Canadian Member of Parliament and former Government Minister David Kilgour and a respected human rights lawyer, David Matas, called *Bloody Harvest: The Killing of Falun Gong for their organs*. The second was Ethan Gutmann’s book *The Slaughter: Mass Killings, Organ Harvesting, and China’s Secret Solution to its Dissident Problem*, published in 2014. The third report, published this year and running to 700 pages, updates these two pieces of research and is co-authored by David Kilgour, David Matas and Ethan Gutmann, under the title *Bloody Harvest/The Slaughter: An Update*. It is to be noted that Ethan Gutman has publically invited any evidence or comments to contradict the research in this report, but as at September 2016 none has been received. Other studies, including *State Organs: Transplant Abuse in China*, published in 2012, and reports by the World Organisation to Investigate the Persecution of Falun Gong and Doctors Against Forced Organ Harvesting, as well as the documentary films *Human Harvest* and *Hard to Believe*, provide further evidence.

The most important point made by David Matas and Ethan Gutmann in their evidence to the Conservative Party Human Rights Commission and in their report is that previous research into forced organ harvesting in China significantly under-estimated the scale of the practice. Their new research based on forensic inquiry into the public records of 712 hospitals in China carrying out liver and kidney transplants leads them to conclude that between 60,000 to 100,000 organs are transplanted each year in Chinese hospitals. One hospital alone, the Orient Organ Transplant Center at the Tianjin First Central Hospital, was performing thousands of transplants a year according to its own bed occupancy data. China officially claims 10,000 organ transplants a year, but the authors contend that this is “easily surpassed by just a few hospitals”. The evidence points to what David Matas called in testimony to the US Congress “mass killing of innocents”.

---

10 Bloody Harvest: The Killing of Falun Gong for their organs - [http://bloodyharvest.info/](http://bloodyharvest.info/)
A crucial fact is that many of the victims of this practice are prisoners of conscience who are jalled because of their practice of Falun Gong, which describes itself as a ‘Buddha-school’ spiritual practice, and other religious minorities including Tibetan Buddhists, Uyghur Muslims and unregistered house church Christians.

According to Ethan Gutmann, the practice of forced organ harvesting began in 1994 when the first live organ harvests of death row prisoners were performed on the execution grounds of Xinjiang. In 1997, Uyghur political prisoners were the target of organs to be forcibly donated to high-ranking Chinese Communist Party officials. By 2001, Chinese military hospitals began targeting Falun Gong practitioners, and by 2003 the first Tibetans were targeted.

Dr Enver Tohti was a cancer surgeon in Urumqi, Xinjiang province, China. In 1995, he was instructed by two of the chief surgeons in his hospital to prepare the mobile surgery equipment and wait for them the next day at a hospital gate, with an ambulance and three other assistants. The following morning at 9am the two chief surgeons arrived in a car, and he was told to follow them. They arrived about half an hour later at Western Mountain (‘Xishan’), an execution ground. Dr Tohti described to the Conservative Party Human Rights Commission what happened next:

“We had been told to wait behind a hill, and come into the field as soon as we’d hear the gun shot. So we waited. A moment later there were gun shots. Not one, but many. We rushed into the field. An armed police officer approached us and told me where to go. He led us closer, then pointed to a corpse, saying ‘this is the one’. By then our chief surgeon appeared from nowhere and told me to remove the liver and two kidneys. He urged me to hurry up, so we took the body into the van and removed his liver and kidneys. An operation to repair an organ is very difficult and takes a very long time to do, but this time it was totally different. It was an operation of extraction, so it was easy and quick. Then our chief surgeons put those organs in a special box, and got into the car. They told me to take my team back to the hospital, and left. I have no idea where they went. I, on the other hand, led my team back to where we came from. That was the end of that. Nobody has ever talked about what we did that day. It is something I wish hadn’t happened. I wish for that man to rest in peace.”

In China, Dr Tohti added, the government “does not treat people as human beings. Officials can do whatever they want.”

**WHAT IS FALUN GONG AND WHY ARE THEY PARTICULARLY TARGETED**

While others, such as Tibetan Buddhists, Uyghur Muslims and unregistered house church Christians are most likely also targeted, there is no doubt that the majority of forced organ harvesting victims are practitioners of Falun Gong. That raises the question of what is Falun Gong and why are they so severely persecuted.
The persecution of Falun Gong is addressed in more detail in the Commission’s report, *The Darkest Moment*, and in many written submissions received by the Commission, available on our website.

Anastasia Lin says: “Falun Gong is many things: a set of meditative exercises, a moral code, a way of life. If you have seen people practicing it in parks, you might have noticed that its exercises and meditation forms resemble Taichi or yoga. But more importantly, Falun Gong is a cultivation way. Cultivation refers to inner transformation – a continual process of refining one’s character, letting go of selfishness and negative thoughts, and nurturing virtue. The core principles that Falun Gong teaches are truthfulness, compassion and forbearance. Practitioners do their best to bring these principles into their lives and apply them to whatever difficult situations they may encounter. In fact, Falun Gong teaches that these principles of Truth, Compassion, and Forbearance represent the very nature of the universe itself – an immutable moral law, and the criteria for discerning what is right from wrong.”

In the 1990s in China, tens of millions of people began practising Falun Gong. By 1998, China’s National Sports Commission estimated that as many as 70 million were Falun Gong practitioners, more than there were members of the Chinese Communist Party. As Ms Lin told the Commission, “This is one major reason that Falun Gong was targeted by the Chinese Communist Party. Such a huge, independent group in society is unprecedented in Communist Party history. The regime had spent the first 50 years of its rule actively destroying all forms of civil society and religious belief—effectively atomising individuals so that they would find no insulation from the pervasive power of the state. The Communist Party was the sole source of moral authority in the land, and when faith in Marxist-Leninism waned, the Party promoted materialism and money-worship to fill the ideological vacuum. Falun Gong practitioners were, without even realizing it, creating an immense, silent challenge to all that. It was a popular revival of the traditional beliefs in the divine, and it taught that material wealth was not the true purpose of their life. Although Falun Gong was strictly apolitical, its moral message was seen as being incompatible with the beliefs and values of the Communist Party.”

In 1999, China’s then President Jiang Zemin launched a severe campaign to crackdown on Falun Gong. As Ms Lin told us, “What unfolded was the largest concerted action of China's security forces since the Maoist era. The persecution was like another Cultural Revolution, except it was aimed only at one part of the population. Everyone was forced to express their stance against Falun Gong. Party members were taken to brainwashing classes. The military was "cleansed" of Falun Gong practitioners. Lawyers were forbidden from defending Falun Gong clients. Families were broken apart, as husbands and wives were expected to express their firm political stand if their partner persisted in the faith. Labour camps were built and new means of brainwashing — called "transformation" — were developed. Hundreds of thousands were detained without trial to face harrowing torture. A whole publishing industry sprung up to spread anti-Falun Gong propaganda. The state-run press inundated the public with lies about Falun Gong, meant to incite hatred towards it.”
While the Conservative Party Human Rights Commission would not at this stage use the term ‘genocide’, which is a term under international law requiring the very highest levels of proof of intent, we note the indications of the potential for this term to be applied to this context. Ethan Gutmann described what is happening as: “A form of genocide cloaked in modern medical scrubs”. Ms Lin said, after describing the persecution campaign:

“All this, of course, is a key ingredient of genocide: to dehumanize the target population. From that point on, Chinese citizens who practiced Falun Gong were outside the protection of the law ... This explains how organ harvesting could come about. With potentially millions of practitioners incarcerated in China’s vast network of prison camps, they became worth more dead than alive. They are blood-typed, and when a blood match is made, they can simply be led away and killed — or simply anesthetized to have their organs are removed while they're still alive.”

CONCLUSIONS

The evidence received by the Conservative Party Human Rights Commission should require all of us, and particularly Her Majesty’s Government, to ask some serious questions and to urgently seek ways to investigate and stop this barbaric practice. As Ms Lin told us in the first hearing of our China inquiry, this tragic and barbaric practice “forces us to confront the question of how humans — doctors trained to heal, no less — could possibly do such great evil?” Her answer: “The aggressors in China were not born to be monsters who take out organs from their people ... It’s the system that made them do that. It’s the system that made them so cold-bloodedly able to cut people open and take out their organs and watch them die. No one is born to be so cruel.”

The United States Congress unanimously passed a resolution in June 2016 (HR 343), condemning the practice of “state-sanctioned forced organ harvesting in the People’s Republic of China”, calling on China to immediately end the practice of organ harvesting from all prisoners of conscience, and demanding an immediate end to the persecution of Falun Gong and the release of all Falun Gong practitioners and other prisoners of conscience. The resolution also encourages the United States medical community to raise awareness about this issue, urges China to allow “a credible, transparent and independent investigation into organ transplant abuses,” and calls on the United States to conduct a more detailed analysis, and “report annually to Congress on the implementation of section 232 of the Department of State Authorisation Act, Fiscal Year 2003 (8 U.S.C, 1182f), barring provision of visas to Chinese and other nationals engaged in coerced organ or bodily tissue transplantation.” The US House of Representatives Foreign Affairs Committee held a hearing on organ harvesting in China, hosted jointly by the Subcommittee on Africa, Global Health, Global Human Rights, and International Organizations and the Subcommittee on Europe, Eurasia, and Emerging Threats.

16 Some reports suggest that some operations may be conducted without anaesthetics, but this is not verified and may only apply to some incidents.
on 23 June 2016. The transcript and videos of the hearing and witness testimony can be found online.\textsuperscript{18}

In July 2016, the European Parliament adopted a Written Declaration (0048/2016),\textsuperscript{19} and in 2013 a resolution in the European Parliament\textsuperscript{20} called for the EU and all Member States to raise the issue of organ harvesting in China; publicly condemn organ transplant abuses in China and raise awareness of this issue among their citizens travelling to China; and conduct a full investigation into organ transplant practices in China. It also called for the prosecution of those found to have engaged in such unethical practices.

Furthermore, the UN Special Rapporteur on torture and other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment and the UN Special Rapporteur on freedom of religion or belief have made requests to China, asking the Chinese Government to explain the sources of extra organs following the increase in the number of organ transplant operations, and to allow them to conduct an investigation into organ transplant practices in China. They have received no response.

In September 2016, one of the world’s most respected voices in the ethics of organ transplantation, Dr Annika Tibell, chief physician at the New Karolinska Hospital Project in Sweden, called for an international inquiry. Dr Tibell was the lead author of The Transplantation Society’s first policy statement on China in 2006 and one of the founders of the Declaration of Istanbul Custodian Group, a major organisation focused on transplantation ethics.\textsuperscript{21}

At a press conference following The Transplantation Society’s conference in Hong Kong recently, the society’s president, Dr Phillip O’Connell addressed his comments to China, saying: “There remains, in many sectors, a deep sense of mistrust of your transplant programs. It is important that you understand that the global community is appalled by the practices, which you have adhered to in the past. Many people in the global community are not persuaded that China has changed.”\textsuperscript{22}

“Trade in organs is immoral and a crime against humanity”, said Pope Francis. The time has come for the United Kingdom to begin to address this grave issue,\textsuperscript{23} both through initiatives


\textsuperscript{23} “Theresa May Should Tackle China’s Forced Organ Harvesting As A Crime Against Humanity, As Mr Speaker Hosts Film Screening In Parliament With Miss World Canada”, by Benedict Rogers, The Huffington Post, 2 September 2016 - http://www.huffingtonpost.co.uk/ben/theresa-may-organ-harvesting_b_11831530.html
in Parliament and through government policy, and to spearhead an international campaign to end this atrocious crime.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

The Conservative Party Human Rights Commission urges Her Majesty’s Government to undertake the following steps:

1. To publicly condemn the continuing practice of forced organ harvesting and urge the Government of the People’s Republic of China to immediately end this practice;
2. To work with other countries to seek a UN Commission of Inquiry to investigate the practice of forced organ harvesting in China or to conduct an inquiry through other recognised international mechanisms, and to assess whether this practice could amount to a crime against humanity under international law;
3. To research, document and release statistics on the numbers of United Kingdom citizens travelling to China for organ transplants;
4. To introduce legislation addressing the issues of organ harvesting, similar to legislation passed in various forms in several other countries including Israel, Belgium, Taiwan, Canada, Australia and the United States, and in particular to prohibit British citizens from travelling to China for the purpose of receiving organ transplants (so called ‘organ tourism’) until the practice of forced organ harvesting ends;\(^\text{24}\)
5. To introduce a travel ban prohibiting medical personnel and government officials engaged in the practice of forced organ harvesting from travelling to the United Kingdom;
6. To urge the Transplantation Society to take appropriate action including banning participants from China who have directly engaged in organ harvesting;
7. To give urgent consideration to other measures it could take to hold the government of the People’s Republic of China to account for this practice and demand an end to forced organ harvesting.

\(^{24}\) International legislative initiatives – see [http://www.stoporganharvesting.org/international-initiatives-legislations/](http://www.stoporganharvesting.org/international-initiatives-legislations/)